This page intentionally left blank
**Dignity at Work**

Human dignity, the ability to establish a sense of self-worth and self-respect and to enjoy the respect of others, is necessary for a fully realized life. Working with dignity is a fundamental part of achieving a life well-lived, yet the workplace often poses challenging obstacles because of mismanagement or managerial abuse. Defending dignity and realizing self-respect through work are key to workers’ well-being. Insuring the dignity of employees is equally important for organizations as they attempt to make effective use of their human capital. In this book Randy Hodson, a sociologist of work and organizational behavior, applies ethnographic and statistical approaches to this topic, offering both a richly detailed, inside look at real examples of dignity in action, and a broader analysis of the pivotal role of dignity at work.

How do people attain and maintain dignity in the face of assaults on dignity at work? How can management within organizations help to preserve dignity and thus enhance workers’ social relations, organizational integrity, and productivity? This book sheds valuable light on the mechanisms by which workers become satisfied and committed employees. Hodson’s exploration of these questions includes ethnographic detail from diverse settings, ranging from automobile manufacturing, to medicine, to home-based sales and temporary clerical work. He focuses on four problems that deflate morale and create conflict: outright mismanagement and abuse, overwork, limits on autonomy, and contradictions of employee involvement. He also analyzes strategies that workers use to maintain and defend their dignity: resistance, citizenship, the creation of independent meaning systems, and the development of social relations at work.

Hodson offers a valuable picture of the causes, consequences, and patterns of workers’ efforts to maintain dignity. He finds that even in workplaces where abuse is common and mismanagement makes pride in accomplishment difficult, workers still find ways to create meaning in work and to achieve self-respect. He uses his findings and analysis to reevaluate contemporary workplace theories, including those based on the traditions of Marx, Weber, Durkheim, Foucault, and feminist theories of the workplace. Hodson’s conceptual model of human agency and dignity contributes broadly to our understanding of the nature of work in advanced societies.

Randy Hodson is Professor of Sociology at Ohio State University. He is the author of numerous articles and books, including the forthcoming *Worlds of Work: Building an International Sociology of Work* (with Daniel Cornfield) and *The Social Organization of Work*, third edition (with Teresa A. Sullivan).
To workers everywhere
whose dignity can be challenged
but cannot be denied.
Contents

List of Figures and Tables  page x
Preface  xiii

Part I  Dignity and Its Challenges

1 Four Faces of Working with Dignity 3
   The Quest for Dignity 5
   Safeguarding Dignity 16
   Denials of Dignity 19
   Conclusions 20

2 Toward a Theory of Dignity 22
   Alienation, Anomie, and Bureaucratic Rationality 22
   Modern Industrial Society 29
   Obstacles and Opportunities 34
   Working with Dignity 41
   Conclusions 49

3 Measuring the Subtle Realms of Work 50
   Organizational Ethnographies 51
   A New Method and New Insights 53
   Strategies for Safeguarding Dignity 59
   Denials of Dignity 73
   Conclusions 80

Part II  The Practice of Dignity

4 Deflecting Abuse and Mismanagement 83
   A History of Mismanagement and Abuse 83
   Direct Personal Supervision 87
   Workplace Norms against Mismanagement and Abuse 91
   Responses to Abuse 99
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Avoiding Overwork</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assembly Work</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Monotony, Exit, and Resistance</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lost Opportunities for Citizenship</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Group Differences</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Defending Autonomy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional and Craft Autonomy</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Experience of Professional and Craft Work</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Citizenship in Professional and Craft Work</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Resistance in Professional and Craft Work</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizational Size and Outside Ownership</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Group Differences</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Negotiating Employee Involvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Varieties of Participation</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Work Life under Employee Involvement</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employee Involvement and Resistance</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employee Involvement and Citizenship</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Group Differences</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Coworkers – For Better or Worse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Social Context of Work Life</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coworkers and the Meaning of Work</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Solidarity and Infighting</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coworker Relations under Bad Management</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coworkers in Assembly Jobs</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Job Autonomy and Workplace Relations</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation and Coworker Support</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conflict and Tension in Service Work</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coworker Relations across Social Groups</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Worker Dignity and Well-Being</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Synthesis</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Infighting, Resistance, and Citizenship</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part III**  The Future of Dignity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Worker Dignity and Well-Being</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Synthesis</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Infighting, Resistance, and Citizenship</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Tables and Figures

Tables

1.1 Dignity at Work  
3.1 Resistance Measures  
3.2 Worker Citizenship Measures  
3.3 Direct Supervision and Resisting Mismanagement and Abuse  
3.4 Production Technology and Excessive Work Demands  
3.5 Management Control and the Defense of Autonomy  
3.6 Organizational Participation and the Pursuit of Meaningful Involvement  
4.1 Working under Direct Supervision  
4.2 Management Abuse Measures  
4.3 Mismanagement Measures  
4.4 Working under Reduced Hours  
4.5 Working under Incompetent Management  
4.6 Abuse, Mismanagement, Worker Resistance, and Citizenship across Social Groups  
5.1 Assembly Work  
5.2 Monotony, Exit, and Resistance on the Assembly Line  
5.3 Reduced Citizenship in Assembly Work  
5.4 Work Experiences, Resistance, and Citizenship across Social Groups  
6.1 Autonomy in Professional and Craft Settings  
6.2 Pride and Citizenship in Professional and Craft Work  
6.3 Resistance and Conflict in Professional and Craft Work  
6.4 Employment Size and Alienation  
6.5 Citizenship and Resistance in Locally Owned Enterprises  
6.6 Autonomy, Resistance, and Citizenship across Social Groups  
7.1 Employee Involvement and Working Conditions  

page 17  
61  
69  
74  
74  
75  
76  
78  
88  
94  
97  
103  
109  
111  
119  
125  
132  
135  
147  
152  
158  
162  
163  
166  
182
List of Figures and Tables

7.2 Resistance under Employee Involvement 187
7.3 Citizenship under Employee Involvement 190
7.4 Employee Involvement, Resistance, and Citizenship across Social Groups 194
8.1 Worker Solidarity Measures 207
8.2 Coworker Conflict Measures 210
8.3 Coworker Relations under Abusive Management 213
8.4 Coworker Relations under Mismanagement 217
8.5 Coworker Relations and Assembly Work 220
8.6 Coworker Relations under Various Forms of Workplace Control 223
8.7 Coworker Relations and Worker Participation 225
8.8 Coworker Relations and Customer Service Work 229
8.9 Coworker Relations across Social Groups 231
9.1 Regression of Worker Infighting, Resistance, and Citizenship on Workplace Characteristics 242
9.2 Regression of Worker Well-Being on Workplace Characteristics and Worker Agency 247
Appendix 1 Resistance Scale 307
Appendix 2 Citizenship Scale 307
Appendix 3 Management Abuse Scale 308
Appendix 4 Mismanagement Scale 308
Appendix 5 Worker Solidarity Scale 308
Appendix 6 Coworker Conflict Scale 309

Figures

3.1 Resistance as strategy 67
3.2 Citizenship as application of knowledge 71
4.1 Management abuse, worker resistance, and citizenship 100
4.2 Mismanagement, worker resistance, and citizenship 105
5.1 Absenteeism and assembly work 126
5.2 Extra effort and assembly work 133
6.1 Creativity in professional and craft work 149
6.2 Insider knowledge and peer training in professional and craft work 155
6.3 Work avoidance and social sabotage under outside ownership 164
7.1 Skill and autonomy in participatory workplaces 183
7.2 Mismanagement and abuse in participatory workplaces 185
7.3 Cooperation in participatory workplaces 192
8.1 Worker responses to management abuse 216
8.2 Coworker relations in mismanaged workplaces 219
8.3 Group discipline under various forms of worker participation 227
9.1 Conceptual model of worker dignity and well-being 239
9.2 Job satisfaction 250
9.3 Creativity at work 253
9.4 Meaningful work 255
Preface

Working with dignity is a foundation for a fully realized life. Despite many denials of dignity faced daily in the workplace, people still strive to do their best, to take pride in their work, and to defend themselves against indignities from employers, and sometimes from coworkers. New challenges are constantly being created for working with dignity by the inexorable process of technological and organizational change and by the unrelenting drive of market systems for profit maximization.

In spite of the centrality of the quest for dignity at work by billions of workers around the world, the pursuit of dignity is rarely a central focus of scholarly writings on the workplace. The challenges to workers’ well-being posed by technological, organizational, and market forces are sometimes a focus. However, rarely do we consider the very serious business of how workers respond to these challenges on a daily basis in the office suite and on the shop floor. The creative and purposive activities of employees to achieve dignity at work are the central focus of this book. I hope that by considering these activities we can gain a better understanding of the daily struggle for dignity at work and the central place it occupies in workers’ lives.

I rely on data from a systematic analysis of the population of organizational ethnographies. These data provide an empirical base for studying the quest for dignity. The in-depth observations offered by workplace ethnographies provide a unique source of information on organizational life that has previously been underutilized.

The inspiration for this book was provided by the work lives and the quest for dignity of many different people. These people include friends, family, acquaintances, employees at offices and factories where I have worked, visited, or toured, and the many students with whom I have discussed workplace issues including our own and other’s quests for dignity at work. I hope this book will be helpful to those who read it and who may see their own struggles reflected in it.

The efforts of many people combined to make this book possible. I would like to thank the men and women in the accounts analyzed here
who allowed themselves to be interviewed and who spoke candidly and eloquently about their lives at work and their struggle for dignity. I would also like to thank the ethnographers who spend so many months and years observing work life and reporting on it in clear and often moving terms.

A special thanks goes to the research staff and students of the Indiana University Sociological Research Practicum who worked on the research project in which we coded the organizational ethnographies. Their probing questions, good will, and enthusiasm resulted in the sort of collective intellectual experience that is too rare in the hurried world of university life. I would like, in particular, to thank Sandy Welsh, Sabine Rieble, Sean Creighton, and Cheryl Sorenson Jamison.

A number of people offered useful comments and constructive criticisms on the project. I am particularly indebted to Dan Cornfield, P. K. Edwards, Bill Form, Craig Jenkins, Garth Massey, Judith Stepan Norris, Vincent Roscigno, and Mike Wallace. Mary Child and the reviewers for Cambridge University Press offered excellent editorial guidance throughout the project for which I am also grateful. Finally, I am especially indebted to my wife and partner, Susan Rogers, for sage advice on all matters concerning work, life, and dignity.


Acknowledgments

Permission has been granted for selected use of material from the following:

From Women on the Line by Ruth Cavendish, Copyright © 1982 by Ruth Cavendish. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission of Routledge and Kegan Paul, Boston, Massachusetts.
From *Forgive and Remember* by Charles Bosk, Copyright © 1979 by University of Chicago Press. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission of the author and The University of Chicago Press.

From *Managing in the Corporate Interest: Control and Resistance in an American Bank* by Vicki Smith. Copyright © 1990 by Vicki Smith. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission of the University of California Press.

From *Chaos on the Shop Floor* by Tom Juravich. Copyright © 1985 by Temple University. All rights reserved. Reprinted by permission of Temple University Press.
Part I

Dignity and Its Challenges